

YAMANASHI-95-02

December 1995

Study on Ground States of Quantum Spin Systems by Restructuring Method

Tomo Munehisa and Yasuko Munehisa

Faculty of Engineering, Yamanashi University
Kofu, Yamanashi, 400 Japan

Abstract

We present a new method to study the ground state of quantum spin systems using the Monte Carlo techniques together with restructured intermediate states which we proposed previously.

Our basic idea is to obtain coefficients in the expansion of the ground state from measurements of the normalized frequencies of each state on the boundary in the Trotter direction. The restructuring method we have proposed makes it possible to carry out simulations within available resources of computers.

For a concrete example we study ladder spin systems with antiferromagnetic intra-chain nearest neighbor interactions, whose ground states may be equivalent to that of the spin 1 chain. For the ladder with ferromagnetic rungs we successfully show how to determine the magnitudes and relative signs of the coefficients in the expansion. When the ladder has antiferromagnetic rungs we examine White's claim that the diagonally situated pair of spins are mostly triplet states in the ground state. Our results strongly suggest that the system has the hidden order which is constructed by the specially aligned triplet states of diagonal pairs.

Section 1 Introduction

Recent development of experiments on the condensed matter has presented us very interesting systems where strong quantum effects will be realized. Among them are the quantum spin systems in low dimensions. Much theoretical work has been done to obtain qualitative and quantitative properties of these quantum effects [1]. One powerful tool to numerically investigate them is Monte Carlo approach using the Suzuki-Trotter formula [2]. In a previous paper [3], where we proposed the restructuring method, we pointed out that proper choice of complete sets which describe the intermediate states in the Suzuki-Trotter formula is quite important in numerical calculations. Then we applied our method to a quantum spin chain system to show that by employing complete sets different from the conventional ones we can obtain improved numerical results. An essential point of our method is to rearrange spin states on neighboring two sites into the singlet and the triplet states when we construct the complete sets.

In this paper we discuss another merit of our method which comes out in study of the system's ground state [4]. In order to provide a concrete example we apply the method to quantum spin systems on a simple ladder [5] which have attracted many people for two reasons. One reason is that this model is an intermediate one between one spin 1 chain which has a finite energy gap (Haldane gap) and two spin 1/2 chains which are gapless. Another reason is that the corresponding material exists and this would show the high temperature superconductivity upon some doping.

An outline of our basic idea is given in the next section together with the model we study as an example. In section 3 we present numerical results and the final section is devoted to discussions.

Section 2 Model and Basic idea

The Hamiltonian we study is

$$\hat{H} = -\frac{J}{2} \sum_{i=1}^N [\vec{\sigma}_{a,i} \vec{\sigma}_{a,i+1} + \vec{\sigma}_{b,i} \vec{\sigma}_{b,i+1}] - \frac{J'}{2} \sum_{i=1}^N \vec{\sigma}_{a,i} \vec{\sigma}_{b,i}, \quad (1)$$

where $\vec{\sigma}_{a(b),i}$ denotes the Pauli matrix sitting on the i -th rung of the leg $a(b)$ and

$\vec{\sigma}_{a(b),N+1} \equiv \vec{\sigma}_{a(b),1}$, N being the total number of rungs. Let us set the intra-chain coupling $J = -1$ throughout this paper and investigate the model with both positive and negative inter-chain couplings J' .

The basic idea is quite simple. In the system's partition function Z its ground state $|G\rangle$ dominates when the inverse temperature β is sufficiently large,

$$Z = \text{tr}(e^{-\beta\hat{H}}) \simeq e^{-\beta E_G} \text{tr}(|G\rangle\langle G|) = e^{-\beta E_G} \sum_{\alpha} \langle\alpha|G\rangle\langle G|\alpha\rangle, \quad (2)$$

where E_G denotes the energy of the ground state and $\{|\alpha\rangle\}$ is a complete set. Accordingly we expect that the partition function Z_{n_t} in the Suzuki-Trotter formula with finite Trotter number n_t would be

$$\begin{aligned} Z_{n_t} &= \sum_{\alpha_1} \sum_{\alpha_2} \cdots \sum_{\alpha_{n_t}} \langle\alpha_1|e^{-\beta\hat{H}/n_t}|\alpha_2\rangle \cdots \langle\alpha_{n_t}|e^{-\beta\hat{H}/n_t}|\alpha_1\rangle \\ &\simeq \sum_{\alpha_1} \langle\alpha_1|G\rangle e^{-\beta E_G} \langle G|\alpha_1\rangle \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

for large n_t and β . Let us expand $|G\rangle$ by $\{|\alpha\rangle\}$,

$$|G\rangle = \sum_{\alpha} c_{\alpha} |\alpha\rangle, \quad (4)$$

where the coefficients c_{α} 's should be real numbers in our representation.

With this expansion (3) reads

$$Z_{n_t} \simeq e^{-\beta E_G} \sum_{\alpha_1} c_{\alpha_1}^2 = e^{-\beta E_G} \sum_{\alpha} c_{\alpha}^2. \quad (5)$$

This means that c_{α}^2 should be the probability to find state $|\alpha\rangle$ on the boundary in the Trotter direction.

Since the number of $|\alpha\rangle$'s, which totals to 2^{2N} on a ladder with N rungs, is enormously large for large N it is technically important to choose a proper complete set for which many of c_{α} 's vanish. In the conventional approach the complete sets $\{|\alpha_n\rangle\}$ ($n = 1, \dots, n_t$) in (3) are constructed from eigenstates of $\sigma_{a(b),i}^z$ with eigenvalues ± 1 denoted by $\pm_{a(b),i}$ or by $s_{a(b),i}$. The complete sets should be therefore

$$|\alpha_n\rangle = |s_{a,1}, s_{b,1}, s_{a,2}, s_{b,2}, \dots, s_{a,N}, s_{b,N}\rangle. \quad (6)$$

In our approach we rearrange states $s_{a,i}$ and $s_{b,i}$ into a singlet state $|\ominus_i\rangle$ and three triplet states $|1_i\rangle$, $|\oplus_i\rangle$ and $|-1_i\rangle$,

$$|\ominus_i\rangle = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (|+_{a,i}, -_{b,i}\rangle - |-_{a,i}, +_{b,i}\rangle),$$

$$\begin{aligned}
|1_i\rangle &= | +_{a,i}, +_{b,i}\rangle, \\
|\oplus_i\rangle &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (| +_{a,i}, -_{b,i}\rangle + | +_{a,i}, -_{b,i}\rangle), \\
|-1_i\rangle &= | -_{a,i}, -_{b,i}\rangle,
\end{aligned} \tag{7}$$

which we denote by S_i . The complete sets we employ are

$$|\alpha_n\rangle = |S_1, S_2, \dots, S_N\rangle. \tag{8}$$

We will see later that this choice effectively reduces the number of non-zero c_α .

What we can measure in simulations with Z_{n_t} is not c_α itself but c_α^2 . One may have a question if there is a way to know the relative sign of each c_α . The answer is yes in the quantum spin case. All we have to do is to change the boundary condition in the Trotter direction from the periodic one to a combination of an open boundary $|\alpha\rangle$ and a fixed boundary $|\alpha_0\rangle$. The corresponding partition function Z'_{n_t} is

$$\begin{aligned}
Z'_{n_t} &= \sum_{\alpha} \sum_{\alpha_2} \dots \sum_{\alpha_{n_t}} \langle \alpha_0 | e^{-\beta \hat{H}/n_t} | \alpha_2 \rangle \dots \langle \alpha_{n_t} | e^{-\beta \hat{H}/n_t} | \alpha \rangle \\
&\simeq \sum_{\alpha} \langle \alpha_0 | G \rangle e^{-\beta E_G} \langle G | \alpha \rangle = e^{-\beta E_G} \sum_{\alpha} c_{\alpha_0} c_{\alpha}
\end{aligned} \tag{9}$$

Thus we will obtain $c_\alpha/c_{\alpha_0} = c_{\alpha_0}c_\alpha/c_{\alpha_0}^2$ in simulations with Z'_{n_t} .

With the normalization condition $\sum_{\alpha} c_{\alpha}^2 = 1$ it would seem that the results with Z'_{n_t} are enough to determine both the magnitude and the sign of the coefficients c_{α} 's but, as we will see in the next section, simulations with Z_{n_t} are quite useful to obtain reliable values of magnitude with small statistical errors.

Section 3 Numerical results

In this section we study a ladder spin system with the Hamiltonian (1) using Monte Carlo techniques. Exact values on a small ladder are also presented to confirm the Monte Carlo results.

First let us work with positive J 's, which mean ferromagnetic rungs. As we stated in Section 2 we expect that by applying the restructuring method we can do with less number of non-zero coefficients in the expansion (4) than using the conventional complete sets. In order to see this in a quantitative manner let us

examine distributions of c_α^2 on an $N = 4$ and $J' = 1$ ladder calculated by the exact diagonalization. With the conventional complete sets (6) the number of non-zero c_α^2 's is sixty-eight in total, twenty of which are greater than 10^{-2} and sum over these twenty c_α^2 's amounts to 0.808. With the rearranged complete sets (8), on the other hand, total number of non-zero coefficients reduces to thirty-eight and among them c_α^2 's that are greater than 10^{-2} are fifteen in number and 0.843 in their sum.

In addition, for the system under consideration it is believed that the ground state is essentially equivalent to that of spin 1 chain, which is made of triplet states on sites and seems to have the hidden order that demands the $|1\rangle$ and $|-1\rangle$ states should appear alternately along the chain with arbitrary number of $|\oplus\rangle$'s between them [6]. The complete sets (8) are much more suitable to describe such a ground state. The exact results on the $N = 4$ and $J' = 1$ ladder stated above, for example, show that all the fifteen states in (8) whose c_α^2 's are greater than 10^{-2} are of this type while others are not. For an $N = 8$ ladder we do not carry out exact calculations any more, but it is easy to see that we have only 255 candidate states in our choice, which can be sorted to 22 states if we take account of the translational invariance due to the periodic boundary condition in the space direction. Contributions of these particular states on larger ladders will be examined in the following Monte Carlo study.

Now we present numerical results with the partition function (5) and the complete sets (8). In this case we do not need to worry about the negative sign problem. We measure frequencies of $|\alpha\rangle$'s appearance on the boundary in the Trotter direction as well as system's energy

$$E = -\frac{\partial}{\partial\beta} \ln Z . \quad (10)$$

In Figure 1 we plot $-E$ per site on an $N = 8$ and $J' = 1$ ladder for several values of β as a function of $1/n_t^2$, with Trotter numbers ranging $16 \leq n_t \leq 32$. Since n_t dependence of physical quantities are known to be $1/n_t^2$ we make a linear fit for data with each value of β to obtain the energy in the $n_t \rightarrow \infty$ limit. We observe the extrapolated values almost coincide, which indicates that these values of β are large enough to realize the ground state. In Figure 2 we compare Monte Carlo

results on normalized frequencies measured on an $N = 4$ ladder at $\beta = 8$ with exact c_α^2 numerically obtained by the exact diagonalization. We see the agreement is satisfactory at this value of β . Figure 3 shows sum of contributions of the states with the hidden order on an $N = 8$ ladder at $\beta = 8$ for several values of J' in the $n_t \rightarrow \infty$ limit. We observe the sum, which indicates sum of c_α^2 for these state, increases toward unity as we change J' from 0.5 to 5. Data for values of $N = 4, 12$ and 16 with $J' = 1$ are also plotted in Figure 3 to show the dependence on N . Since the results for $N = 8$ show no drastic change as a function of J' our data support that this system and the spin 1 chain are equivalent in properties of the ground state. The results also indicate that the hidden order dominates if J' is quite large, while it is less clear for smaller values of J' .

Next we present results on the coefficient itself measured with the partition function (9) instead of (5). Note that in this case, because of the emergence of negatively signed weights, we should measure a physical quantity A in each thermally equilibrated configuration together with its sign and obtain its expectation value by

$$\langle A \rangle = \frac{A_{net}}{Z_{net}} = \frac{A_+ - A_-}{Z_+ - Z_-}, \quad (11)$$

where $Z_+(Z_-)$ is number of configurations with positive (negative) weight and $A_+(A_-)$ denotes the contribution from positively (negatively) signed configurations. Because of the cancellations the statistical error is larger for smaller r ratio, which is defined by

$$r \equiv \frac{Z_+ - Z_-}{Z_+ + Z_-}. \quad (12)$$

Here we limit ourselves to an $N = 4$ and $J' = 1$ ladder and set the fixed boundary in the Trotter direction $|\alpha_0\rangle = |\oplus, \oplus, \oplus, \oplus\rangle$. We then measure normalized frequencies of $|\alpha\rangle$ s' appearance on the open boundary in the Trotter direction, f_α , following to (11). Since f_α should be proportional to $c_\alpha c_{\alpha_0}$ we obtain the value of $c_{\alpha_0}^2$ from

$$\sum \left(\frac{f_\alpha}{f_{\alpha_0}} \right)^2 = \sum \left(\frac{c_\alpha c_{\alpha_0}}{c_{\alpha_0}^2} \right)^2 = \sum \left(\frac{c_\alpha}{c_{\alpha_0}} \right)^2 = \frac{\sum c_\alpha^2}{c_{\alpha_0}^2} = \frac{1}{c_{\alpha_0}^2}, \quad (13)$$

using the normalization condition $\sum c_\alpha^2 = 1$. We then calculate c_α , not c_α^2 , by multiplying $\sqrt{c_{\alpha_0}^2}$ to each f_α/f_{α_0} , where we assume c_{α_0} is positive. Figure 4 plots

the results together with the exact c_α 's. We observe that the data provide relative signs of c_α 's to c_{α_0} completely correctly in spite of rather poor value of the r ratio (which is around 0.15) because $Z_-(Z_+) = 0$ for positive (negative) c_α . The statistical errors on the magnitude of c_α is, however, much worse than the ones measured with the partition function (5).

Finally we study the system with antiferromagnetic rungs, namely with negative J' in (1), which became much interesting recently because of White's conjecture [7]. In the limit of large $|J'|$ this model has the ground state that is a cluster of singlet at rungs as well as the excited state including a triplet state at some rung, with which the system has a finite mass gap. Since many studies [8] suggest this mass gap survives for finite $|J'|$, one is tempted to think the system might be equivalent to the spin 1 chain. In his study based on the density renormalization group equation, White claimed that it is the case. It is reported that roughly 95% of the *diagonal* pairs on a ladder are triplet states in the system's ground state. Here we examine the model by employing the complete sets constructed with eigenstates of the diagonal pair,

$$|\alpha_n\rangle = |S'_1, S'_2, \dots, S'_N\rangle, \quad (14)$$

where S'_i is one of

$$\begin{aligned} |\ominus'_i\rangle &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (|+_{a,i}, -_{b,i+1}\rangle - |+_{a,i}, -_{b,i+1}\rangle), \\ |1'_i\rangle &= |+_{a,i}, +_{b,i+1}\rangle, \\ |\oplus'_i\rangle &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (|+_{a,i}, -_{b,i+1}\rangle + |+_{a,i}, -_{b,i+1}\rangle), \\ |-1'_i\rangle &= |-_{a,i}, -_{b,i+1}\rangle. \end{aligned} \quad (15)$$

Using these complete sets with the partition function (5), we measure sum of normalized frequencies of the states which have the hidden order. Unfortunately we find that serious cancellations prevent us from obtaining statistically meaningful data except for small ladder size N or small values of β shown in Figure 5. In the figure we see, however, that data for a $N = 4$ ladder are enough to indicate this ratio increases rapidly as β grows and at $\beta = 5$ it is in good agreement with the exact value shown by a dashed line. Rapid increments as a function of β are also observed

for $N = 8, 12$ and 16 ladders as far as we could measure. So we expect similar saturations will take place for larger ladders with large values of β . We therefore conclude that the hidden order in this model is numerically observed.

Section 4 Discussions

In this paper we present a new method to study the ground state of quantum spin systems which uses the Monte Carlo techniques applied to the Suzuki-Trotter formula. Studying the ground state by the Monte Carlo approach will help us to understand its physical meanings, to make effective models and to easily measure some physical quantities.

Our basic idea is to observe the states emerging on the boundary in the Trotter direction and count number of appearances of each state so that we can obtain the normalized frequencies which are related to the coefficients in the expansion of the ground state. This method is based on the restructuring method we proposed in a previous paper, which would enable us to effectively reduce the number of candidate states we should consider. We would like to stress here that it is essential from technical points of view to choose some proper complete sets, although any complete sets will do us from theoretical points of view.

In order to make our discussions clear we study ladder spin systems. For the ladder whose rungs are ferromagnetic we show it is possible to describe its ground state using the Monte Carlo results obtained in our method. For the ladder with antiferromagnetic rungs our results support White's report that most diagonal pairs on the ladder are the triplet states. Our data also strongly suggest that the hidden order exists.

Our method would also be applicable to other systems such as spin systems on a square lattice. In order to construct proper complete sets, however, one should have physical insights to the system under investigation.

References

- [1] N.Hatano, Doctor thesis (Tokyo Univ.) 1992;
T.Nakamura, Doctor thesis (Tokyo Inst. Tech.) 1992.
- [2] M. Suzuki, Prog. Theor. Phys. **56** (1976), 1454; J. Stat. Phys. **43** (1986), 883.
M. Makivić, *Computational Approaches in condensed-matter physics*, edited by S. Miyashita, M. Imada and H. Takayama (Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1992), p.129.
- [3] T.Munehisa and Y.Munehisa, Phys. Rev. **B49** (1994), 3347; Prog. Theor. Phys. **92** (1994), 309.
- [4] N. Hatano and M. Suzuki, J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. **62** (1993), 847.
- [5] J. Sólyom and J. Timonen, Phys. Rev. **B34** (1986), 487.
K. Hida, Phys. Rev. **B46** (1992), 8286.
H. Watanabe, Phys. Rev. **B50** (1994), 13442.
- [6] I. Affleck, T. Kennedy, E. H. Lieb and H. Tasaki, Commun. Math. Phys. **115** (1988), 477.
M. den Nijs and K. Rommelse, Phys. Rev. **B40** (1989), 4709.
- [7] S. R. White, preprint (cond-mat/9503104).
- [8] T. Barnes, E. Dagotto, J. Riera and E. S. Swanson, Phys. Rev. **47** (1993), 3196.
S. R. White, R. M. Noack and D. J. Scalapino, Phys. Rev. Lett. **73** (1994), 886.
N. Hatano and Y. Nishiyama, preprint (cond-mat/9506052).

Figure Captions

Figure 1

System's energy E as a function of the Trotter number n_t on an $N=8$ and $J' = 1$ ladder. The ordinate and the abscissa represent $-E$ per site and $1/n_t^2$, respectively. Each datum is an average of twelve measurements with different random number sequences, for each of which we generate 10000 configurations for the thermalizaion and more 10000 configurations for the measurement. Statistical error of the datum

is calculated from the standard deviation among these twelve runs. Here we do not show statistical errors explicitly because all of them are within symbols. Least square fitted lines for each value of β are also shown.

Figure 2

Monte Carlo results on the normalized frequencies of each state $|\alpha\rangle$ in (8) obtained on an $N = 4$ and $J' = 1$ ladder with $\beta = 5$ and $n_t = 32$, together with exactly calculated non-zero c_α^2 where c_α 's are coefficients in the expansion of the ground state (4). The abscissa represents the state $|\alpha\rangle$ with non-zero coefficients which are numbered from 1 to 38. In each of twelve random number sequences we discarded first 2000 configurations and used the following 10000 configurations for the measurement.

Figure 3

Sum of the normalized frequencies on the states possessing the hidden order in (8), which is plotted versus J' for an $N = 8$ ladder and versus N for a $J' = 1$ ladder. Each datum is the extrapolated one from data for $n_t = 16, 20, 24$ and 32 to $n_t \rightarrow \infty$. Data for finite n_t are obtained with twelve random number sequences in each of which we used 20000 configurations with 20000 preceding ones. Errors for the extrapolation calculated from the statistical errors are within symbols.

Figure 4

Monte Carlo results for the non-zero coefficients c_α 's on an $N = 4$ and $J' = 1$ ladder with $\beta = 5$ and $n_t = 32$. We calculated c_α 's using the normalized frequencies obtained from twelve simulations in each of which 10000 configurations are observed after 2000 initial sweeps. The abscissa is for the state numbers which are same to those in Figure 2. We also plot exact values for comparison.

Figure 5

Sum of the normalized frequencies on the states possessing the hidden order in (14) measured on a $J' = -1$ ladder with the Trotter number $n_t = 32$, which is plotted for $N = 4, 8, 12$ and 16 as a function of β . For each β and N we carried out twelve simulations with different random number sequences in each of which we updated the system 20000 times for the thermalization and then did additional 20000 updates for the measurements. The r ratio ranges from ~ 0.76 to ~ 0.01 . The dashed line is the exact value for an $N = 4$ ladder.